

Canadian NATO  
Parliamentary Association



Association parlementaire  
canadienne de l'OTAN

**Report of the Canadian Parliamentary Delegation  
respecting its participation at the Joint Meeting of the Defence  
and Security, Economics and Security, and Political  
Committees and Officers of the Committee on the Civil  
Dimension of Security and the Science and Technology  
Committee**

**Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA)**

**Brussels, Belgium  
February 14-16, 2015**

# Report

## Introduction

The Canadian Delegation to the North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA) has the honour to present its report on the Joint Meeting of the Defence and Security, Economics and Security and Political Committees, held in Brussels, Belgium on 14-16 February 2015. Canada was represented by Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P., Head of the Canadian Delegation, Senator Raynell Andreychuk, Senator Joseph A. Day, Leon Benoit, M.P., Mr. Andrew Saxton, M.P., Jack Harris, M.P., Paul Dewar, M.P., and the Hon. Lawrence MacAulay, P.C., M.P.

The main purpose of the annual joint committee meetings in Brussels, which also include the officers of the Committee on the Civil Dimensions of Security and the Science and Technology Committee, is to provide delegates with an update on the Alliance's activities and operations from senior bureaucrats and military officers working at NATO headquarters. Canadian delegates also met with the NATO Secretary General, Jens Stoltenberg, and were briefed by Canada's Permanent Representative to NATO, Mr. Yves Brodeur.

The meetings in Brussels were conducted under the Chatham House rule.

## Events:

- Presentation by Ambassador Thrasyvoulos Terry Stamatopoulos, Assistant Secretary General, Political Affairs and Security Policy Division, NATO, on NATO's Current Political Agenda
- Presentation by General Philip M. Breedlove, Supreme Allied Commander Europe (SACEUR), NATO, on Hybrid Warfare
- Presentation by Cecilia Malmström, European Commissioner for Trade, on The Transatlantic and Global Trade Agenda
- Presentation by Rick McDonnell, Executive Secretary, Financial Action Task Force (FATF), on FATF's Role in the Fight Against the Finance of Terrorism
- Roundtable with Permanent Representatives to NATO on Addressing Challenges to Euro-Atlantic Security, East and South
  - H.E. Mr Jean-Baptiste Mattéi, Permanent Representative of France to NATO
  - H.E. Mr Maris Riekstins, Permanent Representative of Latvia to NATO
  - H.E. Mr Douglas E. Lute, Permanent Representative of the United States to NATO

- Presentation by Jamie Shea, Deputy Assistant Secretary General, Emerging Security Challenges Division, NATO, on NATO's Response to Emerging Security Challenges after the Wales Summit
- Presentation by Heinrich Brauss, Assistant Secretary General, Defence Policy and Planning Division, NATO, on Implementing the Readiness Action Plan
- Presentation by Ambassador Maurits R. Jochems, Former NATO Senior Civilian Representative in Afghanistan, on Afghanistan Post-2014
- Presentation by Ambassador Marriët Schuurman, Special Representative for Women, Peace and Security to the NATO Secretary General, on The UN Security Council Resolutions on Women, Peace and Security: Opportunities and Challenges from a NATO Perspective
- Meeting with the Permanent Representatives to the North Atlantic Council

### **Summary of Discussions**

- The European Union was meeting over the financial crisis in Greece at the same time as the North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly briefings were occurring in Brussels. Greece must not be permitted to renege on austerity measures secured for funding.
- The mission of NATO as a Security Provider and emphasized key partners and need to take a fresh look at threats against to peace and security and sovereignty of the North Atlantic was summarized.
- Russian efforts to destabilize Ukraine through invasion of Crimea threaten common security structures. The experience of September 2014 ceasefire should be a reminder. Opposition to arming Ukraine at the moment due to fear or escalation was noted.
- Concerns exist over the number of foreign fighters from Belgium who are returning from the warfront.
- A greater exchange of intelligence and information is necessary to thwart terrorist attacks as demonstrated. Last year's attack in Belgium was by a man from France, who had travelled to Syria, Malaysia & Thailand.
- NATO cooperation is more effective than soft power.
- NATO should help Ukraine with organizing security framework & build capacity.
- It is impossible to recognise annexation of Crimea. Despite all organizations going into Crimea it must be stressed that it is not a defacto recognition of Annexation.
- We have a more challenging security environment: dangerous mix of cyber-attacks, threats to sovereignty, and terrorism, which also puts significant refugees on their doorsteps.

- New initiatives to help Ukraine, Georgia, Moldova build their own security: modernize and reform militaries, interoperability.
- NATO welcomes this week's ceasefire declared in Minsk, but adherence will be watched closely.
- Strengthening cooperation through capacity building and training. (DC=Defence Capacity Building Initiative)
- Wales DCBI: Increase with other international organizations. Will provide advisory to Lybia when the situation allows.
- NATO response force has been opened up to all partners.
- No request for NATO to arm Ukraine, but rather this is being asked of individual nations. The sentiment is that we wait to see if the ceasefire takes hold, then providing arms is not necessary.
- Hybrid warfare is fundamentally designed with the text of Article 5 in mind. Its nature is to create ambiguity as to whether or not an action (hybrid) meets the criteria to trigger Article 5.
- Cyber and informational warfare, political sabotage, conventional and nonconventional warfare (eg. Russia starting with little green men in March, then overt in August). Must first identify subvert activity then address in earliest stage. Russia won the pause and now has all the opportunity to reach its military objectives. In place forces can be moved quickly in place. In midst of military modernization including conentional, nonconventional. And nuclear capabilities now form a seamless overall military. Strategy.
- South: Unique challenges: civil war, large scale movement of populations, food water security, society breakdown, extremism, terrorism, disease. Diverse nature requires tool for cross arminization and cooperation. NATO has focused on cooperation, capacity building, advising. Each one is densely complex. We are funding competitors that are using assets against us.
- Article 5: Building recognize what's going on, characterize it for what it is, then Article 4 says threatened nation can have consultations, and NAC will have information required to decide on Article 5 trigger.
- (Aside) NATO unity is more important now more than ever. Putin is trying to divide NATO - Indirectly the Greece EU situation is partitioning a European member. No delegates from Greece were present at our meeting.
- Rapid Action Force:
- Will have homogeneous composition, so they already train together, but it is hoped to have at least 2 major exercises together.

- It is expected that the country providing the force will provide a self-sustaining Battalion Group with NATO providing the enablers (air forces, naval support, intelligence).
- NATO member countries agreed on the Royal Air Force, but not really expected to be called upon and the efforts into such Forces are not occurring.
- An ACTUAL Force NOT a PROBABLE Force is required in order to be taken seriously by Putin.
- Over the last decade Russia has been continuously modernizing its military including a complete refurbishment of its nuclear arsenal, as well as short, medium and long range missiles.
- Trade requires a secure environment. Peace provides security.
- Russia is pushing anti-Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership arguments on the internet.
- Russia has algorithms on Google to manufacture hits on its propaganda sites.
- 34 COUNTRIES, LOCATED IN PARIS WITH Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, who have agreed to fully implement Financial standards. Steering group and plenary meetings. Financial Action Task Force Global Network ;Terrorist Financing Studies: Risk of terrorist abuse in non-profit organizations (2014), Terrorist. Financing in West Africa; the role of Hawala and other similar. Service providers in money laundering and terrorist financing (2013); global money laundering and terrorism financing threat assessment (2010); Terrorist Financing (2008).
- Corrupt countries don't regulate financial institutions:
- NATO is entering its 3rd phase.
- Phase 1: Cold War
- After 1992 Phase 2: Operational Phase (25yrs)
- Phase 3: Wales leaders recognized we're entering 3rd historic period strategic inflection point (combat to non combat). Observation of an "arc of instability": Turkey's East Russia & ISIS to South, south east Libya.
- Readiness Action Plan is NATO's response to phase 3.
- This is NATO adapting to the new reality.
- Posture for phase 1 the line with the enemy was clear.
- On Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant: 60 nation US-led coalition with 28 NATO partners and 32 others. While it is not under NATO command and control NATO capabilities are at the core of fighting ISIS.

- Previously conflicts NATO needed to deal with occurred one after another. Now crises are occurring simultaneously and must be attended to all at once.
- United Nations Security Second Council Report has been Mafia-ized.
- Cyber-proxies for hire will carry out very sophisticated malware attack on a target.
- Aggressors have the full range of arrows in their quiver from nuclear arsenals to cyber warfare. So must NATO.
- Pre-hybrid most venues: Airspace, grids, roads critical networks were all state-owned. The current environment has no limitations.
- The UN is a major customer of improvised explosive device training at Centre of Excellence in Madrid. If we don't learn from experiences in Mali, we won't be prepared for next generation of IEDs.
- US shale gas will begin to be shipped to Europe next year. To be feasible \$60/barrel is necessary. Some companies will fold, but overall will survive.
- Russia cancelled "Southstream". Putin is saying if you want the gas go to turkey to get it. Europe says it will not build a pipeline to Turkey, go through Ukraine instead.
- Amazon has an application in to deliver books on doorstep by drone.
- Should drone purchasers have background checks like firearms purchasers?
- Most of The incursions are going to be urban, building to building rather than country to country.
- (Aside: Putin implements "pods" every 3 yrs. Next one is due 2016)
- Internet is a wonderful connector, but 90% is lies. People can post whatever they want with impunity.
- Internet service providers and Google has said if government is going to shut down websites then they're going to super-encrypt their sites.
- The people who are committing the attacks stop using the websites and social media. They go underground. The intelligence community thought their activities had stopped but they had just stopped using social media/cell phone communication. Websites are not necessarily where the real bad guys are.
- Business won't give malware data it finds to NATO for free because it costs the private sector to find it.
- What happens in Ukraine is the key to the future of Europe. If Ukraine is democratized, so too will Russia be eventually.

- A mother who asked what happened to her son (soldier) who came home in a body bag was arrested.
- Putin's vision is to return to Union of Soviet Socialist Republic and project its sphere of influence.

#### *Dealing with threats:*

- Need to better anticipate threats; share information
- What technologies do we need? (ie. Biometric data for ID)
- Human network and analysis; link up data bases
- Special Operations Forces; for soft ops
- Cyber dimensions and attacks; malware changes daily
- Security in hands of private sector (ISPs and airspace)

#### *Middle East:*

- Number of foreign fighters a grave concern
- Intelligence exchange, key to tracking terrorists
- Important to engage local players, like the *Arab League*

#### **Ukraine:**

- Future relationship with Russia uncertain; currently very limited communication, mostly bi-lateral with member nations, but not direct.
- Self-determination in Crimea did not exist. Referendum happened after the fact, after the invasion. Non-transparent; this way not the way to do it.
- Hybrid warfare; conventional and unconventional warfare. Identify then attribute to a State. Need to develop an unambiguous response to an ambiguous attack.
- Russia is redrawing border by military means. No different than Russia's invasion of Georgia in 2008.
- Supplying military aid to Ukraine is not a NATO decision because NATO has no weapons; member states have the weapons, therefore it will be NATO members' decision.
- Different NATO countries facing different threats (ie. Baltics is Russia, France is terrorism).
- Must remain a united front.

#### **Conclusion**

The annual joint committee meetings in Brussels offer Canada's delegates the opportunity to have in-depth discussions with senior officials at NATO and the EU and with

parliamentarians from NATO member-states on current defence and economic priorities pertinent to the Alliance.

Respectfully submitted,

Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P.  
Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA)



## Travel Costs

<b>ASSOCIATION</b>	Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (NATO PA)
<b>ACTIVITY</b>	Joint Meeting of the Defence and Security, Economics and Security, and Political Committees and Officers of the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security and the Science and Technology Committee
<b>DESTINATION</b>	Brussels, Belgium
<b>DATES</b>	February 14-16, 2015
<b>DELEGATION</b>	
SENATE	Hon. Raynell Andreychuk, Senator Hon. Joseph A. Day, Senator
HOUSE OF COMMONS	Mrs. Cheryl Gallant, M.P. <i>Head of the Delegation</i> Mr. Leon Benoit, M.P. Mr. Paul Dewar, M.P. Mr. Jack Harris, M.P. Hon. Lawrence MacAulay, P.C., M.P. Mr. Andrew Saxton, M.P.
STAFF	N/A
<b>TRANSPORTATION</b>	<b>\$ 54,430.14</b>
<b>ACCOMMODATION</b>	<b>\$ 8,248.66</b>
<b>HOSPITALITY</b>	<b>\$ 0.00</b>
<b>PER DIEMS</b>	<b>\$ 3,137.29</b>
<b>OFFICIAL GIFTS</b>	<b>\$ 0.00</b>
<b>MISCELLANEOUS / REGISTRATION FEES</b>	<b>\$ 0.00</b>

**TOTAL**

**\$ 65,816.09**