

**Report of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association
respecting its participation in the
63rd Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly**

Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

**October 6-9, 2017
Bucharest, Romania**

REPORT

Introduction

The Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association has the honour to present its report on its participation at the NATO Parliamentary Assembly's (NATO PA) 63rd Annual Session in Bucharest, Romania, 6 – 9 October 2017. The delegation was led by Association Chair Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., and included from the Senate, the Honourable Raynell Andreychuk, the Honourable Joseph Day, the Honourable Jane Cordy and the Honourable Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu. From the House of Commons, the delegation included Mr. Michael Cooper, M.P., Mr. Larry Miller, M.P., Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., Mr. Marc Serré, M.P. and Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj, M.P. The delegation was accompanied by Katherine Simonds, Association Advisor, and Association Secretary Jean-François Pagé.

THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

Established in 1955, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA) is an inter-parliamentary organization of legislators from the national parliaments of the 29 member countries of NATO, as well as 14 associate member countries. It is institutionally separate and independent from the official NATO structure, but serves as a liaison for NATO and member parliaments¹. The NATO PA strengthens parliamentary awareness, understanding, and oversight of key defence and security issues, and provides greater transparency of NATO policies. The Assembly also plays a significant role in deepening the crucial transatlantic relationship that underpins the NATO Alliance.

The NATO PA has five thematic Committees: the Defence and Security Committee, the Political Committee, the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security, the Science and Technology Committee, and the Economics and Security Committee. Each of these committees has one or two sub-committees. Similar to parliamentary committees, NATO PA committee members hear from defence and security experts and conduct fact-finding missions throughout the year, which culminate in the drafting of reports and resolutions. Committee members deliberate over these draft reports and resolutions at NATO PA Sessions and therefore the bulk of the Session's work is conducted during Committee meetings.

During the Annual Session, each committee and sub-committee debate, amend, vote on, and adopt resolutions. The resolutions adopted during these meetings become policy recommendations that are then voted on by the whole Assembly during the Plenary Session. While these recommendations are not legally binding, they are widely distributed to governments and parliaments of NATO member and associate member nations. The NATO Secretary General also provides a written response to each policy recommendation.

¹ See North Atlantic Treaty Organization Parliamentary Assembly (NATO PA), "[Our Mission](#)."

Canadian parliamentarians draw significant benefit from their participation in NATO PA events. In addition to gaining a better understanding of strategic issues facing the Alliance and Canada, they are presented with the opportunity to promote Canadian interests and policy priorities in the course of discussions at the NATO PA, its committees and during informal meetings with counterparts from NATO member and non-member states.

THE 2017 ANNUAL SESSION

The 63rd Annual Session was hosted by the Parliament of Romania and chaired by NATO PA President, Mr. Paolo Alli, member of the Italian Chamber of Deputies. More than 800 parliamentarians, experts, and observers from NATO member countries, North Africa, the Middle East and Central Asia participated in the session.

Throughout the Annual Session, discussions were guided by a number of topics that have been of interest to the NATO PA for some time and that are of importance to Canada, such as:

- NATO's ballistic missile defence framework;
- NATO operations, particularly in Afghanistan, Eastern Europe, the Baltics, and Iraq
- Ongoing instability in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region and implications for international security, with a particular focus on Syria, Libya, and the ongoing refugee/migrant crisis;
- The political and security situation in and around Ukraine;
- NATO-Russia relations;
- The weaponization of social media;
- Strengthening NATO resources and capabilities;
- NATO partnerships with other States and international organizations;
- Allied defence and the space domain;
- Cybersecurity and addressing cyber threats.

The program included meetings of the Standing Committee, each of the thematic committees and sub-committees, as well as a Plenary Session. A NATO PA coordination meeting involving members of the Bureau (President, Vice Presidents and Treasurer), Chairpersons of Committees and Subcommittees, and Rapporteurs was also held. In addition, the Chair of the Canadian delegation, **Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P.**, attended a working lunch for members of the Working Group on Education and Communication about NATO.

Delegates also had the opportunity to meet with their counterparts from their respective political groups from across the Alliance: Conservative, Christian Democrat and Associates; Alliance of Liberals and Democrats; and, Socialists. This allowed NATO parliamentarians from similar political parties to discuss issues of mutual interest to their own parties and constituents, further solidifying the nature of democratic debate and parliamentary diplomacy that takes place within the NATO PA.

A. Standing Committee

The Standing Committee² met on Sunday, 8 October 2017, to hear updates from the Assembly's leadership and to plan for upcoming activities in 2018. NATO PA President, Paolo Alli, thanked the Romanian delegation for hosting the 2017 Annual Session and welcomed representatives from Montenegro attending their first Annual Session as full NATO members. Mr. Alli also outlined his activities during the year and his priorities going forward.

A number of procedural matters pertaining to the Session's activities were then detailed by the Deputy Secretary General of the NATO PA, Ruxandra Popa. The Secretary General of the NATO PA, Mr. David Hobbs presented the proposed list of reports and activities for 2018, noting that the subjects struck a good balance between the range of challenges facing the Euro-Atlantic community, such as NATO's adaptation to evolving security threats, relations with Russia, challenges from the NATO's southern flank, and instability in the Korean peninsula. Mr. Hobbs highlighted that approximately 50% of planned visits and events would take place in NATO member states, and 50% in partner countries. The proposed list of reports and activities for 2018 was approved by the Standing Committee.

Dr. Karl A. Lamers (Germany), Chairman of the Working Group on Education and Communication about NATO, updated the Standing Committee on the Working Group's activities. He explained that the Group held its inaugural meeting in Bucharest on Saturday, 7 October 2017, and that so far, 24 out of 29 delegations had appointed members to the Group. Dr. Lamers noted that the Working Group had established close cooperation with NATO's Public Diplomacy Division, gained access to the #WeAreNATO Collaboration Platform, and was planning to visit NATO Headquarters in the months ahead in order to further the Group's efforts in the fields of education and public awareness.

The Standing Committee then reviewed the Assembly's Consideration of Gender. The Secretary General recalled that the Assembly had agreed to include a recommendation in its Rules of Procedure that delegations should seek to achieve gender diversity among their members. He also reported that the language used in the Rules to designate elected officers had been made gender neutral. Pursuant to a Standing Committee decision that expert and guest speakers invited to NATO PA seminars and sessions be gender balanced, Mr. Hobbs reported that in 2017, 24% of speakers invited to NATO PA events were women. This percentage marked the highest ever proportion

² The Standing Committee of the NATO PA is comprised of Heads of National Delegations, Bureau members (President, Vice Presidents and Treasurer), Chairpersons of Committees and Sub-committees, and Rapporteurs.

of women speakers participating in NATO PA events throughout any given year. Mr. Hobbs also informed the Standing Committee of several other achievements toward gender equality in 2017, including new terms of reference adopted by all Committees calling for reports and activities to consider gender perspectives.

Following the adoption of amendments to the Rules of Procedure to account for Montenegro's accession to NATO, President Alli presented the 2018 draft budget to the Standing Committee on behalf of the Treasurer, Marc Angel (Luxembourg). President Alli explained that the NATO PA's financial standing remained strong, and that a proposed budget of EUR 3,890,121 reflected an increase of 1.90% over the previous year to account for the rate of inflation. The 2018 budget was adopted by the Standing Committee.

Turning to future meetings of the NATO PA, the hosts of the 2018 Spring and Annual Session addressed the Standing Committee. Mr. Adam Bielan (Poland) told the Standing Committee that the 2018 Spring Session would take place in Poland's parliament in Warsaw. The Chair of the Canadian delegation, **Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., (Canada)**, then presented a video welcoming NATO PA members and partners to Halifax in November 2018 for the 64th Annual Session. The video and accompanying presentation highlighted that NATO has been a central pillar of Canadian defence and security policy since 1949 and that Canadian commitments to NATO remain unwavering.

Canadian Participation:

Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., represented the Canadian delegation at the Standing Committee meeting, while **Senator Joseph A. Day** attended as a member of the Bureau. **Senator Jane Cordy** also participated in her capacity as a Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance.

B. Committee Business

NATO PA Committees met simultaneously over the course of two days from 7-8 October 2017. During these meetings, Committees debated the reports and resolutions that were first presented at the Spring Session in Tbilisi, Georgia, in May 2017. These reports and resolutions were open for final amendments before being put to a vote in their respective Committees. In addition, these meetings were an opportunity for delegates to hear from academic experts as well as senior military and government officials from Romania, from NATO headquarters, the European Union (EU) and from non-governmental organizations (NGO) on issues of interest to the Alliance.

1. Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security ³

Over two days, the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security heard from three speakers. The first presentation was made by Ambassador Sergiu Celac, Member of the Scientific Council of the New Strategy Centre – a Romanian non-governmental organization focused on defence policy - , on the topic of security and stability in the

³ A more detailed summary of the meeting can be found at NATO PA, "[2017 – CDS Summary Bucharest](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session, Bucharest.

Black Sea from the Romanian perspective. According to the Ambassador, Romania has responded to security situations on NATO's eastern flank by expanding its participation in missions across the region, stretching from the Baltic Sea, to the Black Sea, to the Mediterranean Sea. Russia's actions in eastern Ukraine and Syria mirror its destabilizing engagements in Moldova and Georgia, the Ambassador argued. He also contended that the militarization of the Black Sea region and the deployment of anti-access/area denial (A2/AD) capabilities in Crimea posed a threat to NATO. Ambassador Celac reiterated Romania's commitment to the pledges made during the Wales Summit, and urged all NATO member states to strengthen investments in national security.

The second speaker was Salam Kawakibi, Deputy Director of the Arab Reform Initiative. Mr. Kawakibi's presentation, entitled *In Syria: Enticing Reconstruction and Burying Democracy*, focused on the devastating impact on civilians from the war in Syria. The significant destruction of Syria's infrastructure could be largely attributed to the Assad regime, said Mr. Kawakibi, but he also expressed frustration with what he viewed as inaction on the part of the global community. He told delegates that despite ongoing hostilities, several projects aimed at preparing Syrians for democratic governance have been established, and that local councils had been set up in non-war zones to help move towards decentralization. Some of these councils had strong female representation. Mr. Kawakibi noted that little progress towards peace had been achieved during the negotiations in Geneva and Astana, and warned that the risk of radicalization was growing in areas where the regime was restricting humanitarian aid access.

Next, the Committee heard from Mark Galeotti, Senior Researcher and Coordinator of the Centre for European Security, with the Institute of International Relations based in Prague, Czech Republic. Mr. Galeotti provided an overview of Russia's disinformation and hybrid warfare tactics, explaining that Russia's doctrine includes the use of corruption and hacking into financial systems, in addition to the more traditional concepts of propaganda and espionage. He noted that in Russia, these activities are referred to as "political warfare". Mr. Galeotti described the purpose of the doctrine as threefold: to divide the Alliance, to distract from Russia's strategic interests, and to panic the Alliance by exaggerating the hybrid warfare threat. He argued that President Putin desires more control over former Soviet states, and has used western media to deepen divides in some of these countries. Mr. Galeotti cautioned Alliance members against focusing too much on "information warfare" for two reasons: it has little impact on the effectiveness of Alliance operations; and secondly, Russia views NATO's pre-occupation with "information warfare" as a success.

Lastly, the Committee heard from Theresa Fallon, Director, Centre for Russia, Europe, Asia Studies based in Brussels, regarding instability in East Asia. Ms. Fallon began by describing the implications of North Korea's (or the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, DPRK) nuclear and ballistic missile tests in creating tensions in the region. She also discussed the growing rhetoric between the United States (U.S.) administration and the leader of the DPRK, Kim Jung-Un, and noted that the U.S. strategy in East Asia remained unclear. Ms. Fallon also discussed the roles of China and Russia in relation to the North Korean crisis. Turning to the challenges in the South China Sea, Ms. Fallon

outlined China's land reclamation efforts, including the building of islands and recruitment of "maritime militia", explaining that China has sought to assert influence in the region and threaten Japanese ships. The issue of militant Islam in Southeast Asia was also addressed by Ms. Fallon. She suggested that the number of insurgents leaving the Middle East and central Asia for the Philippines may impact China's "One Belt, One Road" initiative. As a result, it may be in China's interest to become involved to address the situation, she argued.

The Committee's rapporteurs presented their respective draft reports⁴ and resolutions⁵. The floor was then opened for final amendments to the reports and resolutions, which were subsequently adopted. Finally, the Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2018 and elected Committee and Sub-committee officers.

Canadian Participation:

Senator Jane Cordy, Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance, presented her report entitled *Social Media Revolution: Political and Security Implications* and a resolution on *Confronting the Weaponisation of Information*. **Mr. Marc Serré, M.P.** also participated in the Committee's discussions.

2. Defence and Security Committee⁶

The Defence and Security Committee heard three expert presentations over the course of its two days of meetings. The first speaker was Mihai-Viorel Fifor, Minister of National Defence of Romania, who focused his remarks on Romania and the Black Sea Region. Minister Fifor began by underscoring that NATO plays a central role in Romania's defence and security policy, and that the country's future capabilities will be developed in line with its multilateral commitments. Describing the security environment in the Black Sea as "fluid and unpredictable", he told delegates that Romania is responding to developments in the region by investing in situational awareness capabilities. Since 2014, Romania has increased its NATO contributions by hosting components of the Tailored Forward Presence (tFP) on NATO's eastern flank and contributing troops to the U.S.-led battle group as a part of the Enhanced Forward Presence (eFP) in Poland. According to the Minister, Romania's geographic location in south-eastern Europe between the Western Balkans and the Black Sea region is a strategic asset for the Alliance.

General Nicolae-Ionel Ciucă, Chief of General Staff of Romania, addressed the Committee next. He explained that in recent years, the Black Sea region has transformed from an area of cooperation to one of economic, political, and military competition. General Ciucă argued that stability in the Black Sea region is crucial for the security of NATO's eastern flank. He also underscored that continuing to develop

⁴ The Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security's reports included: *Advancing Stability in the Black Sea Region*, *The War in Syria and Iraq: Humanitarian Aspects*; and *Social Media Revolution: Political and Security Implications*. See NATO PA, "[Reports](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

⁵ The Resolutions are available on the NATO PA website: "[Resolutions](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

⁶ A more detailed summary of the meeting can be found at NATO PA, "[Summary of the meeting of the Defence and Security Committee](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session, Bucharest.

Romania's level of interoperability remains a priority. In terms of defence spending, General Ciucă told delegates that Romania spent 2% of its GDP on defence in 2017, and that it was also on track to spend over 20% on major equipment acquisition. General Ciucă also highlighted Romania's contributions to NATO's security and stability efforts in the global coalition to counter Daesh in Syria and Iraq as well as through Operational Resolute in Afghanistan.

Dr. Thomas Karako, Senior Fellow, International Security Program and Director of the Missile Defence Project with the Center for Strategic and International Studies based in Washington also addressed the Committee. Dr. Karako's presentation, entitled *The Future of Integrated Air and Missile Defence in Europe*, began by acknowledging the key role Romania plays in ballistic missile defence (BMD) in Eastern Europe by hosting the Naval Support Facility Deveselu and Aegis Ashore Missile Defense System (AAMDS). Following a strategic overview of the international security environment, including an assessment of the North Korean and Iranian missile threats, Dr. Karako made three key recommendations: retain NATO commitments to BMD and continue developing Aegis Ashore capabilities; expand the focus from BMD to integrated air and missile defence (IAMD); and clearly declare that Russian missile capabilities are a problem for NATO. He also suggested that the creation of a new NATO IAMD Center of Excellence, modelled after similar centres in Abu Dhabi and Hawaii, would strengthen deterrence, improve stability, and align with several of the Alliance's strategic, political, economic, and military objectives.

Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., noted that Canada is not a participant in the U.S. ballistic missile defence program and asked what options NATO may have to protect Canada from ballistic missile threats. **Senator Joseph A. Day**, General Rapporteur of the Committee, responded that Canada should join the U.S. ballistic missile defence system, as per the 2011 recommendation made by Canada's Senate Standing Committee on National Security and Defence .

The final speakers were Elizabeth Pearson, Associate Fellow with Royal United Services Institute (RUSI) and PhD Candidate at King's College London and Emily Winterbotham, Senior Research Fellow, RUSI, on the topic of *Women, Gender, and Violent Extremism*. The speakers detailed findings from a recent research study examining the role of gender in radicalization. By exploring how radicalization differs between men and women recruits to Daesh, the study found that gender affects enabling factors, mechanisms, and locations relating to radicalization. For example, while radicalization of men frequently took place in public places, women were recruited through private networks and online targeting, suggesting that social networks play a key role in the radicalization of women. Ms. Pearson and Ms. Winterbotham emphasized that the results also countered the narrative that women as actors are coerced into joining Daesh. The speakers observed that Daesh attracted women and girls to the idea of the caliphate by giving them agency over their independence, and manipulating female recruits to believe that they would be free from discrimination under Sharia law. While delegates found this to be perplexing, the speakers noted the importance of considering national contexts when evaluating countering violent extremism policies. For example, they explained how disenfranchisement due to alienation and the desire for equality in society played a role in the decision of some

young women to join Daesh. They also informed delegates that since radicalization can happen quickly, it is important for both women and men to be engaged in preventing radicalization.

Three draft reports were considered during the Committee's meetings⁷. As General Rapporteur, Senator Joseph A. Day presented the report on Ballistic Missile Defence and NATO and moderated the discussion that followed. As Acting Chairman of the Committee, Senator Joseph A. Day also presented the draft Resolutions on Closer NATO-EU Cooperation and Supporting the Afghan National Defense and Security Forces, which were discussed and adopted⁸.

On behalf of the Canadian delegation, **Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj , M.P.** proposed an amendment to the resolution on *Closer NATO-EU Cooperation* to include a reference to the essential role played by non-EU members within the transatlantic Alliance. **Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P.**, proposed two amendments to the resolution on *Supporting the Afghan National Defense and Security Forces* in order to: call attention to the importance of bilateral financial contributions to Afghanistan by Alliance members, in addition to the contributions to NATO's Resolute Support Mission; and to urge NATO parliaments to support the Afghan government in its efforts to strengthen good governance practices, improve transparency, combat corruption, implement electoral reform, and empower women and girls. All Canadian amendments were adopted.

Finally, the Committee discussed upcoming studies and activities for 2018 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. **Senator Joseph A. Day** was re-elected General Rapporteur and **Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P.**, was re-elected Vice-Chairperson of the Defence and Security Committee.

Canadian Participation:

Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., Senator Pierre Hugues Boisvenu, Senator Joseph A. Day, Mr. Michael Cooper, M.P., Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, M.P., and Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj, M.P., participated in these discussions.

3. Economics and Security Committee⁹

Three speakers addressed the Economics and Security Committee. Mr. Vasile Iuga, Treasurer of the Aspen Institute Romania discussed the economic situation in the Western Balkans. He provided a brief overview of the dissolution of the former Yugoslavia and its violent history, explaining that the countries that emerged from these conflicts became the least stable and least integrated region in Europe. While support for European accession is widespread in the Western Balkans, these countries continue to face a number of barriers to EU membership. Physical destruction incurred during war, population displacement, weak governance and banking institutions, corruption, poor infrastructure, and uncompetitive industrial sectors are a few of the challenges

⁷ The Defence and Security Committee reports included: *Ballistic Missile Defence and NATO, the Space Domain and Allied Defence, Afghanistan, and NATO-EU cooperation after Warsaw*. See NATO PA, "[Reports](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

⁸ See NATO PA, "[Resolutions](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

⁹ A more detailed summary of the meeting can be found at NATO PA, "[Summary of the meeting of the Economics and Security Committee](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session, Bucharest.

putting countries in the Western Balkans at a disadvantage compared to newer EU members. These issues, along with the high rates of unemployment and heavily regulated economies, have contributed to rising nationalist sentiments, according to Mr. Iuga. He concluded by underscoring the significant need for infrastructure upgrades in order to bolster market access, foster investment, and to improve employment opportunities.

The Committee's second speaker was Mr. Martin Hill, Chairman of the NATO Industrial Advisory Group (NIAG) based in Brussels, on the state of defence industrial cooperation in the Alliance. Mr. Hill began his presentation by describing the role of NIAG as a high-level consultative and advisory body of senior industrialists from across NATO member countries. He told delegates that NIAG provides strategic advice on issues such as transatlantic industrial cooperation and industry's role in capability development for traditional and emerging security challenges. Mr. Hill explained that while defence industrial cooperation has improved, a number of issues undermine its efficiency, such as micro-management by governments and limited R&D investment. Discussing transnational procurement cooperation, Mr. Hill argued that cooperation among smaller groups of nations is more practical than larger groups, and highlighted that translational cooperation can help drive down through-life support costs. At the same time, he said that many cooperative programs in the past had experienced significant cost overruns and delays due to failure to harmonize platforms, poor political decision-making, and unrealistic timeline promises made by industry in order to win contracts.

Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P. asked Mr. Hill if he thought reallocating responsibilities among the commercial and defence sectors would be possible, and if industry would lead such a change. She also asked how NATO could maintain its technological edge over adversaries in areas such as cyber defence. Mr. Hill replied that speed is critical when it comes to technological advantages, and that new frameworks to ensure the quick procurement of IT and cyber technologies should be explored.

The final speaker was Mr. Adreas Goldthau, Professor, Centre of International Public Policy, Royal Holloway, University of London, who discussed geopolitical and economic challenges to Europe's energy security. Mr. Goldthau explained that the "U.S. shale revolution" has led to a decline in energy prices. While energy importing countries have benefited from this trend, countries reliant on energy export revenue have suffered. He noted that although Russia supplies 36% of the EU's oil and 63% of its gas imports, this should not be considered a security issue for two reasons: the EU has invested significantly in energy infrastructure and connectivity with neighbouring markets, and new energy regulations have reduced certain vulnerabilities. Transitioning to a low carbon energy agenda will have enormous fiscal implications on OECD countries, Mr. Goldthau noted. For example, 50% of Germany's federal taxes are related to energy consumption. He also explained, however, that countries in the West have the technology to make the transition to low carbon economies and that this will generate and attract investment. He concluded by suggesting that as we enter a period of geo-economic competition, energy policies will play a crucial role in enhancing security and stability.

Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., asked Mr. Goldthau about the potential negative consequences of transition to a low carbon economy as well as what a successful

transition would look like. He responded that developing economies might not be able to keep pace with developed countries' transition unless clear targets were established to promote necessary investments.

The Committee considered three draft reports and one resolution which were adopted following amendments¹⁰. The Committee discussed future studies and activities, elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers, and was then adjourned.

Canadian participation:

The following Canadian delegates attended the Economics and Security Committee meeting: **Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., Senator Joseph A. Day, and Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj, M.P.**

4. Political Committee ¹¹

The Political Committee heard from three speakers. Mr. Teodor-Viorel Meleşcanu, Romania's Minister of Foreign Affairs, provided an overview of Romania's threat perspective, particularly the security challenges emanating from NATO's eastern flank. He highlighted Russia's aggressive posture, terrorism, the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction, hybrid threats and information warfare as priority concerns for Romania. Minister Meleşcanu underscored the importance of NATO's Enhanced Forward Presence in addressing these issues, as well as the role played by partnerships, noting that cooperation and political dialogue with partner countries contributes to stability. He also told delegates about Romania's contributions to security in the Euro-Atlantic, explaining that Romania is currently contributing to the Enhanced Forward Presence in Poland and the Black Sea region. In 2017, Romania also increased its defence budget to 2% of GDP and decided to join the EU's Permanent Structured Cooperation (PESCO).

Next, delegates heard from Mark Galeotti, Senior Researcher and Coordinator, Centre for European Security, Institute of International Relations, Prague, on Russia and Euro-Atlantic Security. Similar to his presentation before the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security, he argued that President Putin's primary aim is to reclaim Russia's position as a "great power" and outlined the primary goals of Russia's hybrid warfare tactics: 1) to exacerbate existing divisions between Western countries; 2) to distract by shifting Western attention elsewhere; 3) to dismay through exercises like Zapad¹² ; and 4) to deter through creating or worsening problems. Mr. Galeotti

¹⁰ The Economics and Security Committee adopted the following reports: *Assessing and Mitigating the Cost of Climate Change*, *Economic Transition in the Western Balkans: An Assessment*, and *The State of Europe's Defence Industrial Base*. See NATO PA, "[Reports](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest. The resolution adopted was entitled *The European Defence Industrial Base*. See NATO PA, "[Resolutions](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

¹¹ A more detailed summary of the meeting can be found at NATO PA, "[Summary of the meeting of the Political Committee](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session, Bucharest.

¹² According to NATO, "Since 2008, Russia has used its strategic exercises and large-scale snap exercises to hone its military capabilities, undermine regional stability and peace and – twice, first in Georgia and then Ukraine – to mask impending aggression. Exercise ZAPAD 2017 was the latest iteration of such exercises." NATO, "[ZAPAD 2017 and Euro-Atlantic Security](#)," *NATO Review Magazine*, 14 December 2017.

concluded by suggesting that President Putin is unlikely to change his current course of ambitious action, but noted that Russia's ruling class fears the West's economic strength and soft power reach.

The Committee then heard from Andreas Goldthau, Professor, Centre of International Public Policy, Royal Holloway, University of London, on energy and European security issues for NATO. Mr. Goldthau began by discussing the Russia-Europe energy relationship. In his opinion, Russia has not posed a threat to EU energy supplies since 2009 – when Russia cut gas supplies to Ukraine. He also suggested that by 2020, countries in the west may have substantially greater access to gas markets, reducing the EU's reliance on Russian supplies. When asked about nuclear energy as an alternative, Mr. Goldthau explained that it is prohibitively expensive, unless it is subsidized by the State.

The Committee's rapporteurs presented their respective draft reports and draft resolutions which were adopted after the Committee considered final amendments¹³. Mr. Marc Serré, M.P. proposed amendments to two draft resolutions on behalf of the Canadian delegation. The proposed amendments related to Tackling Challenges from the South expanded the countries mentioned in efforts to de-escalate the diplomatic crisis in the Gulf region by referring to initiatives by several Gulf Cooperation Council countries, and also called on NATO member countries to address the underlying causes and drivers of conflict in the Middle East and North Africa by increasing investments in humanitarian aid, governance reforms, and economic development in the region. An amendments to the draft resolution entitled Burden – Fulfilling the Promises added language to ensure that operational contributions are adequately considered in calls for a more balanced sharing of costs and responsibilities. All of the amendments were adopted.

The Committee discussed its studies and activities for 2018 and elected Committee and Sub-Committee officers. **Senator Raynell Andreychuk** was elected Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on NATO Partnerships.

Canadian participation:

The following Canadian delegates participated in the meetings of the Political Committee: **Senator Raynell Andreychuck, Senator Joseph A. Day, Mr. Larry Miller, M.P., and Mr. Marc Serré, M.P.**

- **Science and Technology Committee**

The meeting of the Science and Technology Committee began with a panel discussion on *Maintaining NATO's Technological Edge*. Mr. Thomas H. Killion, NATO Chief Scientist, Mr. Tim Webb, Head of NATO's Capability Delivery Section within the Defence Investment Division, and Mr. Martin Hill, Chairman of the NATO Industrial

¹³ The Political Committee reports adopted included: *Russia: From Partner to Competitor, Tackling Challenges from the South, and Burden Sharing Revisited*. See NATO PA, "[Reports](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest. Two draft resolutions were also adopted: *Tackling Challenges from the South and Burden Sharing – Fulfilling the Promises*. See NATO PA, "[Resolutions](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

Advisory Group (NIAG) discussed how their respective organizations contribute to advancing NATO capabilities, touching on issues raised in their previous presentations before other Committees. Mr. Killion contended that NATO's technological advantage had been eroding due to limited government investment in R&D. He recognized that NATO countries had experienced financial constraints over the past decade, but urged Allies to renew their commitments to R&D and capability development. He also explained that the range of new technologies with military applications, such as Artificial Intelligence and the Internet of Things, were largely driven by commercial investment. Given the rapid pace of technological change in recent years, the NATO Science and Technology Strategy is currently being updated, Mr. Killion pointed out.

Mr. Webb commended the Wales Summit commitments made by NATO member countries to increase defence spending, and stressed the importance of spending strategically. He observed that Allies were increasingly pooling capabilities. In June 2017, for example, six defence ministers agreed to cooperatively develop new maritime patrol aircraft capabilities and gather collective intelligence. A similar approach could be taken in the cyber defence and security sector, argued Mr. Webb. In order to acquire new capabilities that meet the current and future needs of the Alliance, he urged member countries not to rush to replace aging systems, but rather focus on clearly defining the problems before determining military requirements. Mr. Webb informed delegates that the NATO Science and Technology Organization (STO) and Allied Command Transformation (ACT) were working to identify opportunities for innovation within the Alliance, including by working with non-traditional actors such as start-up companies. He concluded by underlining that Allies should reach out to commercial and non-traditional industries earlier in the capability development process in order to fully harness today's technology.

Mr. Martin Hill described the synergy between NIAG and the NATO STO, and noted that around 15% of the STO's work was completed by industry experts. He cautioned NATO parliamentarians that a defence industrial base may not exist in 20 years unless significant investments in S&T were made today. The issue of skillsets was also discussed by Mr. Hill, who stated that there are not enough engineers being trained in the defence industry. Additional investments should be made to foster a new generation of scientists and military personnel as well, Mr. Hill emphasized. Similar to his earlier presentation, he outlined his concerns regarding cooperative procurement programs.

A second panel discussion was also held on "the Internet of Things" (IoT). Mr. Matej Tonin (Slovenia), Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Technology Trends and Security, introduced the topic and highlighted that IoT was a part of everyday life, and an estimated 80 billion smart devices are expected to be connected worldwide by 2025. However, the opportunities born by IoT systems also have inherent risks, warned Mr. Tonin. He mentioned security concerns for consumers such as hacking and glitching, but also linked these concerns to the safety of critical infrastructure. The Rapporteur suggested that NATO member countries should promote standardization of IoT technologies, fund IoT R&D, and strengthen cyber defence and critical infrastructure protection efforts.

The second speaker on the panel was Stefan-Ciprian Arseni, Lt. eng., Scientific Researcher, Military Equipment and Technologies Research Agency, Romania, who

discussed the military applications of IoT. He provided an overview of the work of NATO's IST-147 Research Task Group on the Internet of Military Things, comprised of experts from both the military and private sectors. He outlined the group's primary objectives, which included: defining scenarios for applications of IoT in military operations and defining the framework required to integrate these capabilities; assessing the benefits and risks of IoT applications; and facilitating discussion on this issue. Logistics, situational awareness, and medical care were the initial areas the Group ultimately proposed applying IoT to. The dangers posed by North Korea's offensive cyber capabilities were also raised in the discussion that followed.

The Committee Rapporteurs then presented three reports and one resolution on Maintaining NATO's Technological Edge¹⁴. After considering final amendments, the reports and the resolution were adopted. The Committee then discussed future studies and activities, and elected Committee officers. Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P. was elected Special Rapporteur of the Science and Technology Committee.

Canadian participation:

Canadian delegates participating in the Science and Technology Committee's meetings included **Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P., Senator Joseph A. Day, and Mr. Marc Serré, M.P.**

C. Plenary Sitting

The Plenary Sitting of the 63rd Annual Session took place on the final day, following two days of Committee meetings. Mr. Paolo Alli, President of the NATO PA, presided over the Plenary Sitting. In his opening remarks, he reaffirmed the importance of unity within the Alliance in order to tackle the myriad of security challenges facing NATO, including terrorism, instability on its southern flank, and Russia's aggressive actions in the east. President Alli told parliamentarians that Russia aims to consolidate its presence and influence from the High North to the Middle East, and from Eastern Europe and the Balkans to Asia. He encouraged NATO PA delegates to take concrete measures to prevent Russian interference in politics and media in Allied countries.

The Plenary then heard from Mr. Klaus Iohannis, President of Romania. President Iohannis noted that 2017 marked the third time Bucharest had hosted an Annual Session. He thanked President Alli and NATO PA delegates for their contributions to the transatlantic alliance and their role in promoting the values and principles upon which the Alliance was founded. President Iohannis recalled the numerous and evolving threats facing the Alliance, but stressed that NATO has been able to project stability both within and beyond NATO's borders. He welcomed NATO's increasingly visible role on its southern flank and spoke about the need for a strong response to transnational terrorism. Parliaments play a significant role in ensuring NATO has the resources it needs to undertake these wide-ranging objectives, the President underlined. He also

¹⁴ The reports adopted by the Science and Technology Committee were: Maintaining NATO's Technological Edge: Strategic Adaptation and Defence Research & Development, Food and Water Security in the Middle East and North Africa, and The Internet of Things: Promises and Perils of a Disruptive Technology. See NATO PA, "[Reports](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest. See also NATO PA, "[Resolutions](#)," Sessions, 2017 Annual Session – Bucharest.

pointed out that Romania has increased its contributions to stability in the Euro-Atlantic region, including by and allocating 2% of its GDP to defence in 2017.

Next, Călin Popescu-Tăriceanu, President of the Senate of Romania, addressed the Assembly. He began by reflecting on the importance of NATO PA meetings in responding to the complex array of modern security challenges such as terrorism, cyber threats, aggressive actions by states and non-state actors, and Russian hybrid warfare tactics. He stressed that “safety begins at home” and urged member countries to invest in their own resiliency by striving to reach the 2% GDP defence spending target. Mr. Popescu-Tăriceanu then reminded the Assembly of Romania’s long history of participation in NATO missions, such as in Afghanistan and Kosovo, and closed by underscoring the importance of maintaining cooperative relationships with NATO partners including Moldova, Ukraine, and Georgia.

The Assembly then heard from Mr. Liviu Dragnea, President of the Chamber of Deputies of Romania. Mr. Dragnea identified the escalation of hostilities on NATO’s eastern flank and in the Black Sea region as the most pressing issue facing the Alliance. Given Romania’s geographic position, it is preparing to confront potential adversaries who may seek to invade its borders and Mr. Dragnea suggested that the Romanian armed forces were ready to confront such a challenge if necessary. He added that the Alliance has a responsibility to promote peaceful dialogue in order to prevent conflict. Mr. Dragnea urged NATO parliamentarians to allocate their defence resources efficiently as these costs can be significant, but commented that adequate funding is needed to meet today’s challenges. Nurturing the transatlantic partnership, strengthening NATO-EU cooperation, and enhancing regional dialogue in the Black Sea region were other priority issues outlined by Mr. Dragnea.

Lastly, NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg addressed the delegates. He began by stating his commitment to remain in close contact with the NATO PA. He thanked Romania for hosting the Assembly at this critical time. Mr. Stoltenberg expressed how NATO is striving to tackle numerous challenges simultaneously. In the south, the Alliance is addressing the arc of instability and its largest military effort continues to be in Afghanistan, where 13,000 NATO troops from 39 NATO member states and partner countries are helping train Afghan security forces. NATO is also boosting its support to partners in the Middle East and North Africa, working to improve situational awareness and information sharing. “From tweets to tanks” guarding against cyberattacks, disinformation, and hard military power is an increasingly vital component of NATO’s mission, said Mr. Stoltenberg. Finally, he touched on the issue of burden sharing and stressed the importance of narrowing the gap in defence spending between the U.S. and the rest of the Allies. He commended the real progress made by Allies and noted that the period from 2015-2017 was marked by 3 consecutive years of increased defence spending across the EU and Canada. He also drew attention to the fragmentation of European defence industry, detailing that while the U.S. has one type of battle tank, Europe has 17; while the U.S. has four types of frigates and destroyers, Europe has 29; and while the U.S. has 6 types of fighter jets, Europe has 20. This fragmentation has implications on interoperability and superfluous costs. He closed by saying that NATO relies on the members of the Assembly to engage with their counterparts and the citizens they represent to explain what NATO is and what it does.

During the question and answer period, **Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj , M.P.**, noted that since the 2014 illegal annexation of Crimea, Russia has continued to send weapons across the border into Ukraine and that Canada has provided significant bilateral support to Ukraine's security and military forces. He asked the Secretary General how he envisioned NATO's role in enhancing Ukraine's military capability. In response, Secretary General Stoltenberg said that NATO allies provide strong political and practical support to Ukraine. He pointed to logistical assistance, command and control, and cyber defence as areas of Allied support for Ukraine's territorial integrity. He also encouraged NATO countries to provide in additional bilateral support for Ukraine.

Next, elections were held for the positions of NATO PA President, Vice-Presidents and Treasurer. Mr. Paolo Alli (Italy) was re-elected President of the NATO PA. **Senator Joseph A. Day** was re-elected as one of the Vice-Presidents of the Assembly. NATO PA Committee reports and resolutions were then presented by their respective rapporteurs, which included **Senators Jane Cordy** and **Joseph A. Day**, and subsequently adopted.

In closing, NATO PA President Alli thanked the Romanian Delegation, its staff, the staff of the Romania Parliament, the International Secretariat, and all others who were instrumental in the Session's success.

OTHER MEETINGS

Canadian parliamentarians attended a briefing session with Canada's Ambassador to Romania, Bulgaria and the Republic of Moldova, Kevin Hamilton. Ambassador Hamilton updated the delegates on recent political developments in Romania as well as and key issues related to the Canada-Romania bilateral relationship. Members of the Canadian Armed Forces participating in a rotation of NATO's Enhanced Air Policing Mission and air training activities in Romania also joined the briefing session and shared with the Canadian parliamentarians their experiences in the mission as well as the mission's objectives.

SUMMARY

The NATO PA provides Canadian parliamentarians with an opportunity to learn about the broader strategic issues facing the Alliance, which have an impact on Canada's national security and defence. It also gives them an attentive international forum in which to promote Canadian interests and values in the course of discussions and debates about future Alliance policy and strategy. As this report indicates, the 2017 Annual Session offered NATO PA members a number of opportunities to substantially shape the outcome of discussions, convey a Canadian perspective on key issues of concern, and gain a better understanding of strategic issues facing Canada, the Alliance and Canada's partner countries.

Canadian delegates had the opportunity to learn more about Romania's domestic and regional security environment over the course of the Assembly's various debates and presentations. Romanian officials clearly outlined their defence and security priorities as stability in the Black Sea region and increased defence expenditures among NATO allies. During his address to the Plenary, Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg extolled Romania's leadership, indicating that by contributing to NATO operations, hosting a

BMD site, and reaching the 2% of GDP defence spending target, Romania was helping keep NATO's nearly 1 billion citizens safe.

Overall, the NATO PA appreciates the opportunity to participate in the process of monitoring the implementation of the commitments agreed to at the Wales and Warsaw Summits, particularly with respect to defence and deterrence on NATO's Eastern Flank, and projecting stability on its Southern Flank. All members of the NATO PA continue to be concerned about Russia's military activism and its use of hybrid warfare tactics to undermine the stability of NATO governments and societies. Instability in the Middle East and North Africa continue to be priorities for the NATO PA as it explores how it can effectively address the root causes of conflict and key drivers of record-level migration flows. The situation on the Korean peninsula and NATO BMD were of particular focus at this Annual Session. Afghanistan, particularly NATO's ongoing training mission in that country, continues to be a priority. Delegates also had the chance to evaluate NATO innovation efforts and the opportunities and challenges for armed forces associated with recent technological developments.

Canada and Canadian parliamentarians continue to have strategic interests in all these issues and deeply value the opportunity to contribute to the activities of the NATO PA.

Respectfully submitted,

Ms. Leona Alleslev, M.P.
Chair of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association

Travel Costs

ASSOCIATION	Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association
ACTIVITY	63rd Annual Session
DESTINATION	Bucharest, Romania
DATES	October 6-9, 2017
DELEGATION	
SENATE	Hon. Raynell Andreychuk, Hon. Pierre-Hugues Boisvenu, Hon. Jane Cordy, Hon. Joseph A. Day
HOUSE OF COMMONS	Ms. Leona Alleslev, Mr. Michael Cooper, Mr. Larry Miller, Mr. Pierre Paul-Hus, Mr. Marc Serré, Mr. Borys Wrzesnewskyj
STAFF	Mr. Jean-François Pagé, Ms. Katherine Simonds
TRANSPORTATION	\$ 76,012.85
ACCOMMODATION	\$ 10,369.67
HOSPITALITY	\$ 368.75
PER DIEMS	\$ 7,000.72
OFFICIAL GIFTS	\$ 0
MISCELLANEOUS	\$ 94.42
TOTAL	\$ 93,846.41